

September 11, 2013

VIA HAND DELIVERY

Mr. Bill Melton, P.E.
Mobile County Engineering Department
Mobile Government Plaza
6th Floor South Tower
205 Government Street
Mobile, Alabama 36644

Re: Mobile County Project CIAP-MC06-0001 Mobile County Recycling Center
Award Recommendation

Dear Mr. Melton,

Enclosed please find the five (5) original bid packages that were received and three copies of the bid tabulation spreadsheet on the above referenced project. All of the submitted bids contained a bid bond and acknowledged Addendum #1. All five (5) plan holders submitted a bid.


The final engineer's estimate for the project was \$2,212,200.00, including allowances and alternates. Five (5) bids were received and these ranged from \$2,373,600.00 to \$2,639,000.00. The low bid was submitted by Ben Radcliff Construction for \$2,373,600.00. The second lowest bid received was \$2,380,639.00 submitted by MW Rogers Construction Company, LLC. The highest bid received was \$2,639,000.00 submitted by White-Spunner. Highlighted cells in the tabulation of bids indicate irregularities in the provided pricing (i.e., no unit prices provided, totals only, or math errors).

We have reviewed the unit prices submitted by the low bidder and found no math errors within the submitted quote. We found no irregularities in the prices submitted by the low bidder.

The total bid provided by the low bidder was only 7% more than the engineer's estimate.

After complete analysis of the bidding documents, we respectfully recommend acceptance of the low bid from Ben Radcliff Construction for \$2,373,600.00 to include all alternates and allowances.

Sincerely,
DRIVEN ENGINEERING, INC.


Avalisha Fisher, PE
For the Firm





I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THIS IS A TRUE AND CORRECT TABULATION OF BIDS

Avalisna Fisher, P.E.

MOBILE COUNTY PROJECT CIAP-MC06-0001
 MOBILE COUNTY RECYCLING CENTER

ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE \$2,212,200.00

PROJECT TOTAL	UNIT	DESCRIPTION	Ben Radcliff			MW Rogers			JF Pate			Rod Cooke			White-Spunner			Low Bidder Evaluation	
			UNIT PRICE	ADD / DEDUCTS	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	ADD / DEDUCTS	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	ADD / DEDUCTS	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	ADD / DEDUCTS	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	ADD / DEDUCTS	TOTAL AMOUNT	Average	% Difference
(1) EQUIPMENT			No irregularities			math error on waste containers item			No irregularities			No irregularities			No Unit prices provided for equipment - this affects only items with more than 1.0 quantity				
1.00	EA	CONVEYORS FOR HORIZONTAL BALER	\$99,000.00		\$99,000.00	\$94,932.00		\$94,932.00	\$99,200.00		\$99,200.00	\$106,582.00		\$106,582.00	\$96,000.00		\$96,000.00	\$99,142.80	0%
1.00	EA	SORTING PLATFORM/CONVEYOR	\$34,000.00		\$34,000.00	\$34,928.00		\$34,928.00	\$34,121.00		\$34,121.00	\$23,890.00		\$23,890.00	\$33,000.00		\$33,000.00	\$31,987.80	6%
1.00	EA	SORTING CONVEYOR TIPPER	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	\$12,976.00		\$12,976.00	\$10,374.00		\$10,374.00	\$17,680.00		\$17,680.00	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	\$12,206.00	-18%
1.00	EA	HORIZONTAL BALER	\$219,000.00		\$219,000.00	\$205,095.00		\$205,095.00	\$220,246.00	-\$11,000.00	\$209,246.00	\$206,285.00		\$206,285.00	\$212,000.00		\$212,000.00	\$212,525.20	3%
2.00	EA	GLASS BREAKER	\$13,500.00		\$27,000.00	\$14,553.00		\$29,106.00	\$13,783.00		\$27,566.00	\$13,270.00		\$26,540.00	\$13,500.00		\$27,000.00	\$13,721.20	-2%
1.00	EA	GLASS BREAKER/CRUSHER	\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00	\$16,080.00		\$16,080.00	\$13,636.00		\$13,636.00	\$7,294.00		\$7,294.00	\$14,000.00		\$14,000.00	\$12,602.00	-5%
1.00	EA	CAN DENSIFIER	\$45,000.00		\$45,000.00	\$49,165.00		\$49,165.00	\$50,182.00		\$50,182.00	\$43,602.00		\$43,602.00	\$48,000.00		\$48,000.00	\$47,189.80	-5%
1.00	EA	VERTICAL BALER	\$18,000.00		\$18,000.00	\$20,708.00		\$20,708.00	\$18,819.00		\$18,819.00	\$17,810.00		\$17,810.00	\$18,000.00		\$18,000.00	\$18,667.40	-4%
30.00	EA	WASTE CONTAINERS	\$1,300.00		\$39,000.00	\$1,100.00		\$33,000.00	\$1,259.00		\$37,770.00	\$1,061.60		\$31,848.00	\$1,233.33		\$37,000.00	\$1,190.79	9%
1.00	EA	FORKLIFT	\$25,000.00		\$25,000.00	\$25,118.00		\$25,118.00	\$23,087.00		\$23,087.00	\$24,707.00		\$24,707.00	\$27,000.00		\$27,000.00	\$24,982.40	0%
1.00	EA	SKID STEER	\$45,000.00		\$45,000.00	\$49,731.00		\$49,731.00	\$54,995.00		\$54,995.00	\$45,772.00		\$45,772.00	\$50,000.00		\$50,000.00	\$49,099.60	-8%
<i>Subtotal Equipment</i>					\$573,000.00			\$570,839.00			\$578,996.00			\$552,010.00			\$572,000.00	\$569,369.00	1%
(2) CONSTRUCTION ITEMS																			
1.00	LS	BASE SITE BID	\$1,431,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$1,441,000.00	\$1,600,000.00	-\$160,000.00	\$1,440,000.00	\$1,532,000.00	-\$50,000.00	\$1,482,000.00	\$1,620,181.00	-\$37,000.00	\$1,583,181.00	\$1,694,000.00		\$1,694,000.00	\$1,575,436.20	-9%
1.00	LS	ADDITIVE ALTERNATE 1 (ADDITIONAL BAY)	\$87,000.00		\$87,000.00	\$95,000.00	-\$6,000.00	\$89,000.00	\$109,000.00		\$109,000.00	\$92,800.00	-\$6,500.00	\$86,300.00	\$84,000.00		\$84,000.00	\$93,560.00	-7%
1.00	LS	ADDITIVE ALTERNATE 2 (RESTROOM IN PROCESSING)	\$9,000.00		\$9,000.00	\$14,000.00	-\$2,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$11,000.00		\$11,000.00	\$10,500.00	-\$2,000.00	\$8,500.00	\$8,000.00		\$8,000.00	\$10,500.00	-14%
1.00	LS	ADDITIVE ALTERNATE 3 (BENCHES, SIGNAGE, PLAQUE, AND EXTERIOR SIGN WITH BRICK BASE)	\$41,000.00		\$41,000.00	\$58,000.00	-\$12,000.00	\$46,000.00	\$48,000.00		\$48,000.00	\$53,000.00	-\$3,600.00	\$53,000.00	\$57,000.00		\$57,000.00	\$51,400.00	-20%
<i>Subtotal Construction Items</i>					\$1,578,000.00			\$1,587,000.00			\$1,650,000.00			\$1,730,981.00			\$1,843,000.00	\$1,677,796.20	-6%
(3) ALLOWANCES																			
1.00	LS	BRICK ALLOWANCE (800 PER THOUSAND FOR	\$21,600.00		\$21,600.00	\$20,800.00		\$20,800.00	\$22,400.00		\$22,400.00	\$21,840.00		\$21,840.00	\$22,000.00		\$22,000.00	\$21,728.00	-1%
1.00	LS	DOOR HARDWARE (\$500 PER DOOR LEAF FOR MATERIAL ONLY)	\$11,000.00		\$11,000.00	\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00	\$19,000.00		\$19,000.00	\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00	\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00	\$13,200.00	-17%
1.00	LS	FURNITURE	\$30,000.00		\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00		\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00		\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00		\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00		\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	0%
1.00	LS	LANDSCAPING, IRRIGATION, AND FENCING	\$100,000.00		\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00		\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00		\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00		\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00		\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	0%
1.00	LS	DECORATIVE GATE	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00		\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	0%
1.00	LS	CONTIGENCY ALLOWANCE	\$50,000.00		\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00		\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00		\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00		\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00		\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	0%
<i>Subtotal Allowances</i>					\$222,600.00			\$222,800.00			\$231,400.00			\$223,840.00			\$224,000.00	\$224,928.00	-1%
<i>Total without Allowances</i>					\$2,151,000.00			\$2,157,839.00			\$2,228,996.00			\$2,282,991.00			\$2,415,000.00	\$2,247,165.20	-4%
<i>Total WITH Allowances</i>					\$2,373,600.00			\$2,380,639.00			\$2,460,396.00			\$2,506,831.00			\$2,639,000.00	\$2,472,093.20	-4%
PROVIDED UNIT PRICES SUMMARY																			
ITEM	UNIT	DESCRIPTION	Ben Radcliff			MW Rogers			JF Pate			Rod Cooke			White-Spunner			Low Bidder Evaluation	
1	CY	ALDOT ITEM 210-A UNSUITABLE MATERIALS REMOVAL (Unclassified Excavation (undercut))			\$6.00			\$7.50			\$6.45			\$15.00			\$7.00	\$8.39	-28%
2	CY	CONCRETE FOUNDATION REMOVAL			\$99.00			\$23.00			\$8.25			\$300.00			\$50.00	\$96.05	3%
3	CY	MASS EARTH EXCAVATION			\$5.50			\$7.50			\$6.45			\$15.00			\$4.00	\$7.69	-28%
4	CY	TRENCH EARTH EXCAVATION			\$8.00			\$9.50			\$8.63			\$30.00			\$7.00	\$12.63	-37%
5	CY	HAND EARTH EXCAVATION			\$30.00			\$30.00			\$13.75			\$50.00			\$20.00	\$28.75	4%
6	CY	COMPACTED EARTH FILL																	
6a	CY	A. GENERAL OROPEN SITE AREAS			\$10.00			\$13.00			\$12.00			\$20.00			\$10.00	\$13.00	-23%
6b	CY	B. TRENCH BACKFILL			\$12.00			\$14.00			\$12.65			\$25.00			\$25.00	\$17.73	-32%
6c	CY	C. SELECT FILL			\$10.00			\$13.00			\$12.00			\$20.00			\$15.00	\$14.00	-29%
7	CY	TOPSOIL			\$17.00			\$19.00			\$17.00			\$30.00			\$12.00	\$19.00	-11%
8	PER SF	SIDEWALKS 5'-0" WIDE			\$4.50			\$4.75			\$6.25			\$10.00			\$5.00	\$6.10	-26%
9	PER SF	ASPHALT PAVING IN PLACE (NO STRIPING)			\$3.00			\$5.50			\$4.90			\$1.50			\$1.50	\$3.28	-9%